

ScienceDirect



Self-construal: a cultural framework for brain function Shihui Han¹ and Glyn Humphreys²

Humans have created complex cultures that provide frameworks for our lives, guiding our behavior and thoughts. Recent brain imaging studies have uncovered cultural influences on brain activity in multiple tasks. We review recent cultural neuroscience findings that illustrate that (a) selfconstrual, a cultural trait that differentiates between East Asian and Western societies, mediates group differences in brain activity between East Asians and Westerners; and (b) priming interdependent/independent self-construals modulates brain activity engaged in sensory/motor and cognitive/affective processes. These findings provide new insights on human brain function and suggest that self-construals provide a cultural framework that constrains brain activity underlying multiple cognitive and affective processes.

Addresses

¹ Department of Psychology, PKU-IDG/McGovern Institute for Brain Research, Peking University, Beijing, China

 $^{\rm 2}$ Department of Experimental Psychology, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Corresponding author: Han, Shihui (shan@pku.edu.cn)

Current Opinion in Psychology 2016, 8:10–14 This review comes from a themed issue on Culture

Edited by Michele Gelfand and Yoshi Kashima

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2015.09.013

2352-250/© 2015 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Introduction

Culture, consisting of shared beliefs and behavioral scripts, has an enormous influence on human lives by providing a meaning system for both individuals and populations, which motivates their behavior within a particular cultural context. Culture functions as a framework for structuring behavior by setting up social rules and norms. Individuals start to learn specific cultural beliefs/values/norms and practice culturally specific behavioral scripts from early childhood. Cultural learning and experience not only help to formulate routine ways of doing things but also shape styles of mental (cognitive and affective) activity [1,2]. Cultural knowledge and traits are delivered from one generation to the next as an inheritance system that influence social/physical environments [3] and interacts with genes to shape human behavior [4].

Self-construal, that is, how an individual perceives, comprehends, and interprets the self, is one of the most important cultural traits that influences human behavior and has been used to explain cultural differences in behavior and cognition/emotion. Markus and Kitayama [5] proposed that Western culture encourages an independent self-construal that conceptualizes the self as an autonomous and bounded entity, emphasizing the independence and uniqueness of the self. In contrast, East Asian culture promotes an interdependent self-construal that conceptualizes the self as interconnected and overlapping with close others, emphasizing harmony with these close others. Self-construals mediate cultural group differences in emotion and cognition [6,7] and temporary priming of interdependent and independent self construals leads to causal changes of cognition and behavior [8,9].

Interestingly, recent cultural neuroscience studies [10-13] have shown that influences of self-construals go beyond behavioral and psychological effects. By integrating brain-imaging techniques such as functional magnetic resonance imaging (fMRI) and event-related brain potentials (ERPs), researchers compared brain activity from two cultural groups dominated by independence or interdependence or recorded brain activity from one culture group after being primed with independence or interdependence. The results demonstrate that how we view the self and self/other relationships (i.e., self-construals) modulates the brain activity involved in self-referential processing and other cognitive/affective processes. Here, based on recent cultural neuroscience findings, we propose that these self-construals provide a cultural framework for the neural substrates of cognitive and affective processes. We review cross-cultural and self-construal priming imaging findings which indicate that the mode by which people think of the self (as either interdependent or independent), mediates cultural group differences in brain activity and causes changes of brain activity across a variety of tasks. These findings suggest that self-construal is a key cultural trait that activates a cognitive framework that constrains neural strategies and modulates the neural processes underlying cognition and emotion.

Self-construals mediate cultural group differences in brain activity

Early cross-cultural brain imaging studies explored cultural influences on brain activity by searching for cultural group differences in neural activity. fMRI studies have reported distinct patterns of brain activity between participants from East Asian and Western societies in tasks emphasizing visual perception [14^{••},15,16], attention [17^{••}], causal attribution [18^{••}], mental calculation [19], self-reflection [20^{••}], and mental state reasoning [21] (see highlights in reference for details). These studies, however, failed to uncover which cultural orientation mediated the observed group differences in brain activity. This is an important issue for cultural neuroscience research because participants from East Asian and Western societies differ across a variety of cultural beliefs and it is necessary to clarify what cultural beliefs underlie the observed group differences in brain activity.

One cultural neuroscience approach to solve this issue is to measure the particular cultural values such as independence/interdependence that are potentially mediating cultural effects. Such designs have allowed researchers to test specific hypotheses that the distinct patterns of brain activity in different cultural groups are mediated by selfconstruals. For example, Ma et al. [22**] tested the hypothesis that activity in the medial prefrontal cortex (mPFC) — linked to encoding the self-relevance of stimuli [23,24] — is increased in Western relative to East Asian cultures, whereas activity in the temporoparietal junction (TPJ) — a cortical junction zone at the border of the posterior parts of the temporal lobe and the inferior parts of the parietal lobe, which has been shown to be involved in belief reasoning and perspective taking [25] is enhanced in East Asian relative to Western cultures. In addition, Ma et al. investigated whether cultural group differences in brain activity were mediated by interdependent self-construals. They scanned Chinese and Danish college students as the participants made judgments of social, mental and physical attributes in relation to themselves and to public figures. Self-construals were measured using Singelis's Self-Construal Scale [26]. It was found that judgments of the self compared to a public figure elicited greater mPFC activations in Danes compared with Chinese participants regardless of attribute dimensions for judgments. On the other hand, self-judgments of social attributes induced greater TPJ activity in Chinese compared with Danes. The self-construal measure revealed greater interdependence in Chinese compared to Danish participants. More interestingly, the measure of interdependence was positively correlated with TPJ activity but negatively correlated with the mPFC activity. A mediation analysis further demonstrated that the difference in TPJ activity between Chinese and Danes was fully mediated by the interdependence of self-construal. These findings indicate that group-level differences in TPJ activity can be partially explained by individual differences in interdependence and that self-construals play a key role in mediating cultural group differences in brain activity related to taking others' perspective during self-reflection.

Cross-cultural ERP studies have also shown evidence for the mediating role of self-construal in cognition. Kitayama and Park [27] recorded ERPs from European Americans and Asians while they performed a flanker task to earn reward points assigned either to themselves or a friend. Kitayama and Park found that the error-related negativity (ERN) — a form of brain activity contingent on error responses over the central/parietal region — was greater when participants performed the task for reward to the self relative to when rewards accrued for the friend. However, this self-centric effect was evident in European Americans but not in Asians. Furthermore, it was found that interdependent self-construal mediated the group difference in the ERN self-centric effect. Thus interdependent self-construal can be used to explain group differences in a neural correlate of self-centric motivation.

The mediating role of self-construal is not limited to brain activity underlying explicit self-related tasks. Na and Kitayama [28] reported culture-based variation in the N400, an ERP component sensitive to semantic processing. Presentation of a trait adjective was preceded by a facial photo with trait-implying behavior that was semantically incongruent or congruent with the adjective. This effect was observed in European Americans but not in Asian Americans and the group difference in the N400 incongruity effect was mediated by independent selfconstrual. An earlier ERP study even reported that the parietal P3 component — a positive potential that peaks around 300-400 ms after stimulus onset with the maximum amplitude over the parietal or frontal scale sites in response to target objects was larger in amplitude in European Americans than in East Asians and the group difference in the P3 amplitude was mediated by interdependent self-construal [29]. Taken together, these cross-cultural imaging studies indicate that group differences in brain activity engaged in different tasks/ stimuli can be similarly mediated by the same cultural value, that is, the type of self-construal adopted by the individual.

Priming interdependent/independent selfconstruals modulates brain activity

Cultural psychologists propose that an individual may identify with multiple cultural systems and may be able to switch between different cultural systems in response to specific social contexts and interactions [30]. This idea has stimulated investigations of how brain activity is modified by activation (or priming) of specific cultural values and beliefs. Based on an intervention through priming we may infer a causal relationship between culture and brain activity. The most frequent manipulation here has been the priming of interdependent/independent self-construals. A typical procedure to prime interdependent self-construal is to ask participants to read essays containing plural pronouns ('we' or 'us') or to think how the self is different from others. In contrast, to prime independent self-construal, participants read essays containing singular pronouns ('I' or 'me') or to think how the self is similar to others [31].

Early fMRI studies reported that priming independent compared to interdependent self-construals in Chinese participants induced greater right frontal activity in response to one's own face $[32^{\bullet\bullet}]$. A later study found that priming individualistic vs. collectivistic values in Asian-Americans led to increased activation in self-related mPFC and posterior cingulate cortex (PCC) - a brain region engaged in episodic memory [33] — when participants reflected on their own traits in general [34]. Recent research has extended these early findings by demonstrating effects of self-construal priming on brain activity involved in other cognitive/affective processes. For example, priming East Asian Americans with interdependent values enlarged an N400 response to affective incongruity in the emotional expression of a central face relative to the surrounding faces as participants judged the expression of this central face [35], suggesting that interdependent self-construal facilitates attention to emotional context. Similarly, priming Chinese participants with interdependent self-construals increased the reward activity in the bilateral ventral striatum when winning money for a friend during a gambling game [36^{••}]; in this case, the activation of an interdependent processing mode may enhance reward associated with close others. Priming self-construals also modulated empathic neural responses to strangers' physical pain that were decreased by interdependent self-construal priming among Chinese (possibly due to exclusion of strangers from ingroup by interdependent self-construal priming) but increased by independent self-construal priming among Westerners (possibly due to exclusion of any others from ingroup by independent self-construal priming) [37]. In addition, priming of independent self-construal, which possibly weakened ingroup/outgroup concept can reduce racial in-group biases in empathic neural responses within the anterior cingulate and insular [38].

Self-construal priming also modulates sensorimotor activity. Priming independent self-construals increased the amplitude of frontal EEG activity at about 130 ms after a painful electric shock was applied to the left hand of Chinese participants [39]. Here, the temporary shift in self-construal can affect pain perception by modulating the neural activities in early somatosensory processing of physical pain, suggesting that increased self-focus enhances pain experience. Priming interdependent self-construal compared to a no-priming baseline condition increased motor-evoked potentials induced by transcranial magnetic stimulation applied to the motor cortex [40], possibly due to that reminding the connections between oneself and others modulates the mirror system to tune the individual to social input. Self-construal priming even modulates the brain activity during a resting state (e.g., to keep eyes open and try not to think of anything particular). Wang et al. [41] first identified that, relative to a calculation task that required simple addition

and multiplication, both interdependent and independent self-construal priming increased activity in the ventral mPFC and PCC. They further revealed that interdependent compared to independent self-construal priming increased local synchronization of spontaneous activity in the dorsal mPFC but decreased local synchronization of spontaneous activity in the PCC during the resting state. These findings suggest that the interdependent self-construal priming may facilitate mental readiness for attention to social contexts whereas the independent self-construal priming may promote a mental readiness state for self-focusing. Taken together, these findings demonstrate variations of brain activity as a consequence of self-construal priming and thus provide evidence for a cause-effect relationship between specific cultural values and specific neurocognitive processes.

Conclusion and directions for future research

The cultural neuroscience findings indicate that performing the same task involving the same stimuli can engage distinct patterns of brain activity in individuals from different societies, and these group differences in brain activity can be mediated by specific cultural values. Moreover, self-construal priming induces transient shifts in the default style of processing toward interdependent or independent ways of thinking, and this in turn is linked to changes in brain activity. These findings indicate that brain responses to stimuli during a task are, to a certain degree, constrained by both sustained (due to long-term cultural experiences) and transient cultural frameworks (due to short-term exposure to cultural values). This framework biases the brain to respond in a specific way to guide behaviors that can easily fit into a particular sociocultural context.

Cultural neuroscience findings raise important questions for future research. If there are sustained as well as transient effects of cultural factors, then it will be important to understand how these variations may be linked to intrinsic brain connectivity during a resting state [41]. Other research indicates that effects of the neurotransmitter/hormone oxytocin on brain responses were larger in those who showed stronger tendency of interdependence [42]. It is thus interesting to investigate how cultural values interact with the function of particular neurotransmitters in the brain. Also cultural differences in self-construals may be limited to individuals with specific genes (e.g., DRD4) ([43], also Kitayama et al., in this special issue) and the associations between interdependence and brain activations linked to social cognition may also be genetically moderated (e.g., via the serotonin transporter polymorphism and oxytocin receptor gene) [44,45^{••}]. These results raise the question of whether and how the effects of culture on brain activity vary across individuals with different genotypes. Finally, there is the issue that cultural frameworks change over time — for instance, emerging factors such as the internet

and large-scale emigration may generate more common cultural experiences across the globe. How do these within-lifetime changes modulate culturally-dependent thoughts and brain activity in future? We should not think of culture as a static factor but as an over-arching framework that is constantly evolving. Cultural neuroscience findings allow us to speculate and predict the emerging changes of the functional organization of the brain that provide a neural basis of social adaptation for the next generation.

Conflict of interest statement

Nothing declared.

Acknowledgements

This work was funded by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Projects 31421003, 31470986, 91332125), the Ministry of Education of China (Project 20130001110049), and the Leverhulme Trust, United Kingdom.

References and recommended reading

Papers of particular interest, published within the period of review, have been highlighted as:

- •• of outstanding interest
- Nisbett RE, Peng K, Choi I, Norenzayan A: Culture and systems of thought: holistic versus analytic cognition. *Psychol Rev* 2001, 108:291-310.
- Tsai JL: Dynamics of ideal affect. In Changing Emotions. Edited by Hermans D, Rimé B, Mesquita B. Psychology Press; 2013:120-126.
- Richerson PJ, Boyd R, Henrich J: Gene-culture coevolution in the age of genomics. Proc Natl Acad Sci 2010, 107:8985-8992.
- 4. Kim HS, Sasaki JY: Cultural neuroscience: biology of the mind in cultural contexts. Ann Rev Psychol 2014, 65:487-514.
- Markus HR, Kitayama S: Culture and the self: implications for cognition, emotion, and motivation. *Psychol Rev* 1991, 98:224-253.
- 6. Su JC, Lee RM, Oishi S: The role of culture and self-construal in the link between expressive suppression and depressive symptoms. *J Cross-Cult Psychol* 2012, 44:316-331.
- 7. Ren XP, Lu KW, Tuerdi M: Uyghur-Chinese and Han-Chinese differences on social orientation. *Cult Brain* 2014, 2:141-160.
- Kühnen U, Oyserman D: Thinking about the self influences thinking in general: cognitive consequences of salient selfconcept. J Exp Soc Psychol 2002, 38:492-499.
- 9. Lin Z, Han S: Self-construal priming modulates the scope of visual attention. *Quart J Exp Psychol* 2009, 62:802-813.
- Han S, Northoff G: Culture-sensitive neural substrates of human cognition: a transcultural neuroimaging approach. Nat Rev Neurosci 2008, 9:646-654.
- Kitayama S, Uskul AK: Culture, mind, and the brain: current evidence and future directions. Annu Rev Psychol 2011, 62:419-449.
- Han S, Northoff G, Vogeley K, Wexler BE, Kitayama S, Varnum MEW: A cultural neuroscience approach to the biosocial nature of the human brain. Ann Rev Psychol 2013, 64:335-359.
- Chiao JY, Cheon BK, Pornpattananangkul N, Mrazek AJ, Blizinsky KD: Cultural neuroscience: progress and promise. Psychol Ing 2013, 24:1-19.
- 14. Gutchess AH, Welsh RC, Boduroĝlu A, Park DC: Cultural
 differences in neural function associated with object
 - differences in neural function associated with object processing. Cogn Affect Behav Neurosci 2006, 6:102-109.

This study scanned American and East Asians when viewing pictures of (1) a target object alone, (2) a background scene with no discernable target object, and (3) a distinct target object against a meaningful back-ground. It was found that Americans, relative to East Asians, activated more regions implicated in object processing, including bilateral middle temporal gyrus, left superior parietal/angular gyrus, and right superior temporal/supramarginal gyrus. These results suggest that cultural experiences subtly direct neural activity, particularly for focal objects, at an early stage of scene encoding.

- Goh JO, Chee MW, Tan JC, Venkatraman V, Hebrank A, Leshikar ED, Park DC: Age and culture modulate object processing and object-scene binding in the ventral visual area. Cogn Affect Behav Neurosci 2007, 7:44-52.
- Goh JO, Leshikar ED, Sutton BP, Tan JC, Sim SK, Hebrank AC, Park DC: Culture differences in neural processing of faces and houses in the ventral visual cortex. Soc Cogn Affect Neurosci 2010, 5:227-235.
- Hedden T, Ketay S, Aron A, Markus HR, Gabrieli JD: Cultural
 influences on neural substrates of attentional control. *Psychol Sci* 2008, 19:12-17.

This study scanned East Asians and European Americans during performance of simple visuospatial tasks that required absolute judgments (ignoring visual context) or relative judgments (taking visual context into account). Both groups showed activations in frontal and parietal brain regions known to be associated with attentional control was greater during culturally non-preferred judgments than during culturally preferred judgments. The results suggest that the cultural background of an individual moderates activation in brain networks engaged during even simple visual and attentional tasks.

 Han S, Mao L, Qin J, Friederici AD, Ge J: Functional roles and cultural modulations of the medial prefrontal and parietal activity associated with causal attribution. *Neuropsychologia* 2011, 49:83-91.

This study investigated cultural differences in brain activity underlying causal attribution of physical events by scanning American and Chinese subjects. It was found that, while the medial prefrontal activity involved in causality judgments was comparable in the two cultural groups, the left parietal activity associated with causality judgments was stronger in Chinese than in Americans regardless of whether the contextual information was attended. The findings suggest that causal inference in the medial prefrontal cortex is universally implicated in causal reasoning whereas contextual processing in the left parietal cortex is sensitive to cultural differences in causality perception.

 Tang Y, Zhang W, Chen K, Feng S, Ji Y, Shen J, Liu Y: Arithmetic processing in the brain shaped by cultures. Proc Natl Acad Sci 2006, 103:10775-10780.

20. ZhuY, Zhang L, Fan J, Han S: Neural basis of cultural influence on self representation. NeuroImage 2007, 34:1310-1317.

This study recorded brain activity using fMRI from Chinese and Westerners during reflection on personality traits of oneself and one's mother. The authors found overlapping activity in the medial prefrontal cortex during trait judgments on the self and mother in Chinese but stronger medial prefrontal activity during trait judgments on the self than mother in Westerners.

- Kobayashi C, Glover GH, Temple E: Cultural and linguistic influence on neural bases of theory of mind': an fMRI study with Japanese bilinguals. Brain Lang 2006, 98:210-220.
- Ma Y, Bang D, Wang C, Allen M, Frith C, Roepstorff A, Han S:
 Sociocultural patterning of neural activity during self-reflection. Soc Cogn Affect Neurosci 2014, 9:73-80.
 This study scanned Chinese and Danish participants using fMRI during

This study scanned Chinese and Danish participants using fMRI during judgments on physical, mental, and social attributes of oneself and a celebrity. It was found that Danish participants showed stronger activity in the medial prefrontal cortex during reflection on one's own attributes in all the three dimensions, whereas Chinese participants showed stronger activity in the temporoparietal junction during reflection on social attributes of the self.

- Northoff G, Heinze A, de Greck M, Bermpoh F, Dobrowolny H, Panksepp J: Self-referential processing in our brain-a metaanalysis of imaging studies on the self. *NeuroImage* 2006, 31:440-457.
- Han S, Northoff G: Understanding the self: a cultural neuroscience approach. Prog Brain Res 2009, 178:203-212.

- Saxe R, Kanwisher N: People thinking about thinking people: fMRI investigations of theory of mind. *NeuroImage* 2003, 19:1835-1842.
- Singelis TM: The measurement of independent and interdependent self-construals. Pers Soc Psychol Bull 1994, 20:580-591.
- Kitayama S, Park J: Error-related brain activity reveals selfcentric motivation: culture matters. J Exp Psychol Gen 2014, 143:62-70.
- Na J, Kitayama S: Spontaneous trait inference is culturespecific: behavioral and neural evidence. *Psychol Sci* 2011, 22:1025-1032.
- 29. Lewis RS, Goto SG, Kong LL: Culture and context east Asian American and European American differences in P3 eventrelated potentials and self-construal. Pers Soc Psychol Bull 2008, 34:623-634.
- **30.** Hong Y, Morris M, Chiu C, Benet-Martinez V: **Multicultural minds:** a dynamic constructivist approach to culture and cognition. *Am Psychol* 2000, **55**:709-720.
- Gardner WL, Gabriel S, Lee AY: I value freedom, but we value relationships: self-construal priming mirrors cultural differences in judgment. *Psychol Sci* 1999, 10:321-326.
- 32. Sui J, Han S: Self-construal priming modulates neural

• substrates of self-awareness. *Psychol Sci* 2007, **18**:861-866. This is the first fMRI study that illustrates modulations of brain activity by cultural priming. The authors present fMRI evidence that the right frontal activity in response to one's own face is enhanced by independent vs. interdependent self-construal priming.

- Cavanna AE, Trimble MR: The precuneus: a review of its functional anatomy and behavioural correlates. Brain 2006, 129:564-583.
- Chiao JY, Harada T, Komeda H, Li Z, Mano Y, Saito D, Iidaka T: Dynamic cultural influences on neural representations of the self. J Cogn Neurosci 2010, 22:1-11.
- Fong MC, Goto SG, Moore C, Zhao T, Schudson Z, Lewis RS: Switching between Mii and Wii: the effects of cultural priming on the social affective N400. Cult Brain 2014, 2:52-71.
- Varnum ME, Shi Z, Chen A, Qiu J, Han S: When Your reward is
 the same as my reward: self-construal priming shifts neural responses to own vs. friends' rewards. NeuroImage 2014, 87:164-169.

This study manipulated participants' self-construal (independent vs. interdependent) and found that, when an independent self-construal was primed, subjects showed greater activation in the bilateral ventral

striatum in response to winning money for the self (vs. for a friend) during a gambling game. However, priming an interdependent self-construal resulted in comparable activation in these regions in response to winning money for the self and for a friend. The findings suggest that interdependence may cause people to experience rewards for a close other as strongly as they experience rewards for the self.

- Jiang C, Varnum MEW, Hou Y, Han S: Distinct effects of selfconstrual priming on empathic neural responses in Chinese and Westerners. Soc Neurosci 2014, 9:130-138.
- Wang C, Wu B, Liu Y, Wu X, Han S: Challenging emotional prejudice by changing self-concept: priming independent selfconstrual reduces racial in-group bias in neural responses to other's pain. Soc Cogn Affect Neurosci 2015, 10:1195-1201.
- 39. Wang C, Ma Y, Han S: Self-construal priming modulates pain perception: event-related potential evidence. *Cogn Neurosci* 2014, **5**:3-9.
- Obhi SS, Hogeveen J, Pascual-Leone A: Resonating with others: the effects of self-construal type on motor cortical output. J Neurosci 2011, 31:14531-14535.
- 41. Wang C, Oyserman D, Li H, Liu Q, Han S: Accessible cultural mindset modulates default mode activity: evidence for the culturally situated brain. Soc Neurosci 2013, 8:203-216.
- Liu Y, Sheng S, Woodcock KA, Han S: Oxytocin effects on neural correlates of self-referential processing. *Biol Psychol* 2013, 94:380-387.
- Kitayama S, King A, Yoon C, Tompson S, Huff S, Liberzon I: The dopamine D4 receptor gene (DRD4) moderates cultural difference in independent versus interdependent social orientation. *Psychol Sci* 2014, 25:1169-1177.
- Ma Y, Wang C, Li B, Zhang W, Rao Y, Han S: Does self-construal predict activity in the social brain network? A genetic moderation effect. Soc Cogn Affect Neurosci 2014, 9:1360-1367.
- 45. Luo S, Ma Y, Liu Y, Li B, Wang C, Shi Z, Li X, Zhang W, Rao Y,
- Han S: Interaction between oxytocin receptor polymorphism and interdependent culture values on human empathy. Soc Cogn Affect Neurosci 2015, 10:1273-1281.

This study investigated whether and how oxytocin receptor polymorphism (OXTR rs53576) interacts with interdependence to affect human empathy. The authors scanned A/A and G/G homozygous of OXTR rs53576 during perception of others' pain. Hierarchical regression analyses revealed stronger associations between interdependence and empathic neural responses in the insula, amygdala and superior temporal gyrus in G/G compared to A/A carriers. The findings provide the first evidence for gene × culture interactions on empathic neural responses.